PARENTAL ALIENATION SYNDROME IN THE LEGISLATION OF THE MEXICAN REPUBLIC

Gabriela Santiago Sanchez  
Juárez Autonomous University of Tabasco, Mexico  
https://orcid.org/0000-0002-8168-8884  
santiagosanchezgabriela@gmail.com

Francisca Silva Hernandez  
Juárez Autonomous University of Tabasco, Mexico  
https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3533-0002  
fany987@hotmail.com

German Martinez Prats  
Juárez Autonomous University of Tabasco, Mexico  
https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6371-448X  
germanmtzprats@hotmail.com

Resume

The legislation of Tabasco and in other states in review of their reforms is not established the figure of parental alienation, leaving a lag in the defense of the minor in the civil or family system of the State. The parental alienation syndrome causes conflict in the process of separation or end of marriage in case of having children, being they the main affected in this process. Therefore, the interest in addressing and describing the laws of the Mexican state regarding parental alienation.

Keywords: Alienation, Parental, Separation, Alienation, Rejection.

Introduction

The term «PARENTAL ALIENATION SYNDROME OR SAP» has a series of certain implications that, although, For many, the situation does not qualify clinically to take the word forward, being so to determine as such it should obtain clinically recognized symptoms. In order to know the main idea in a more concrete way, the term "parental" remains to be defined, which we will analyze later. Parental alienation is interpreted as the conduct of power that can be exercised in another person, in this case the person in power would be a relative, one of the parents and this would exercise that same power in the minor and in some way there would be a limitation imposed on a person, the boy.

The SAP has not currently been recognized in many states of the country, because although the subject is known, it is not yet regulated as such in all Mexican legislation. Well, this is done from the idea of others as their own, being that once appropriate such actions are created as a habit of contempt towards their relative, and each of the actions, although they affect the minor in some way, are not directed for them, by the child. On the contrary, it is a way of believing that the damage is being done to the other parent (Vázquez, 2017).

A very important point of this topic is that not in all the codes they speak of parental alienation practiced only by parents, it speaks of the manipulation generated by a relative, where one is on the side of one of the parties with the aim of generate rejection of the opposite parent of the alienating family.

The various definitions and the legal world of SAP are addressed, in addition to realizing how many implications this practice entails. The consequence of knowing what role each one plays and from where the behavior of the parties involved is born. This behavior can be motivated by many issues, but all for the same purpose "to show rejection to one of the parents."

1. Parental Alienation Syndrome

The Parental Alienation syndrome was described and cataloged by Dr. Richard Gardner, in 1985, who defined it as “a disorder that occurs mainly in the context of conflicts of physical or moral custody of the parents. Its primary manifestation is the campaign to denigrate a child against one of the parents, a campaign that has no justification, but is the result of a combination of programming (brainwashing) and indoctrination of one of the parents and the children's own contributions in creating a villain in the target parent ”(Suaste Guerra, 2014).
Parental alienation is interpreted as the conduct of power that can be exercised in another person, in this case the person in power would be a relative, one of the parents and this would exercise that same power on the minor and in some way there would be an imposed limitation for a person, the child. Being an action temporarily or indefinitely where you cannot limit or establish a period of time in which I know that two parties would be affecting, the minor and the alienated father.

PAS has not currently been recognized in many states of the country, however, it can be conceived as psychological issues that are having an impact on the emotional state of each minor, since the objective of this is not to physically attack with blows, but rather that their main actions are based on insults, bad ideas, contempt, humiliation towards an ascendant only. And each of the actions, although they affect the minor in some way, are not directed at them, on the contrary, it is a way of believing that the damage is being done to the other parent. Therefore, the parental alienation syndrome is defined in a general way as that way in which one of the parents manages to verbally influence the decisions of a minor, in this case it would be the child who is involved as part of the problem, this being not the one who voluntarily attacks one of the parties with words, but rather that the parties are induced by a parent in order to generate contempt for the other, even if the minor or child has appreciation for him or her. Well, this is made of the idea of others as their own, being that once appropriate such actions are created as a habit of contempt towards their family member.

2. Legal System About SAP

Over time, Mexico has managed to advance in terms of laws that regulate human behavior, in this way it is possible to coexist in a healthier and more appropriate way with regard to society. There is an important issue in which Mexican law has for the most part failed to regulate legislation and although there are various articles in our constitution that protect a minor, the parental alienation syndrome is not classified as a crime in the major part of Mexico, however, there are some states that do qualify as such and impose a sanction on whoever induces or practices SAP.

In the first place, in a child what must prevail and take care of in a main way is his integrity; both physical and moral to ensure protection to the minor. Although, in Mexican legislation, various norms that govern the protection of them and even when it is regulated, every day one more case is presented in which the child is violated by one of his parents, causing in some way a psychological problem that as It can be short-term, the period of time can also be prolonged. Therefore, the Political Constitution of the United Mexican States in its article 4 paragraph 9,10 and 11 establishes the following:

“In all decisions and actions of the State, the principle of the best interests of children will be watched over and complied with, fully guaranteeing their rights. Boys and girls have the right to satisfy their needs for food, health, education and healthy recreation for their integral development. This principle should guide the design, execution, monitoring and evaluation of public policies directed at children. ”

Ascendants, guardians and custodians have the duty to preserve these rights. The State will provide what is necessary to promote respect for the dignity of children and the full exercise of their rights.

The State will grant facilities to individuals so that they contribute to the fulfillment of the rights of the child. (Political Constitution of the United Mexican States, 2021)

Now, taking this article as a parameter, if it is the State that guarantees the best interests of children and parents who must grant it, how is it then that the SAP is not regulated by the CPEUM even though it is the one who must ensure for the protection of minors? Well, this is not regulated and even if this syndrome is in some way psychological violence towards children, little by little it is advancing in the legal field and is taking more importance, both in the defense of some lawyers and being the most applicable method for disturbing an ascendant. This phenomenon is the cause of the irresponsibility of parents who, wanting to create bad times for the other,

A code that is in charge of regulating the family part in a more personal way with regard to parental authority exercised on children is the Federal Civil Code, which directs the protection that parents or, where appropriate, whoever is at position of the minor must give him, therefore, the legal system in its article 416 establishes the following:

In case of separation of those who exercise parental authority, both must continue with the fulfillment of their duties and may agree on the terms of their exercise, particularly in relation to the custody and
custody of minors. In the event of disagreement, the family judge will resolve what is conducive by hearing the Public Ministry, without prejudice to the provisions of article 94 of the Code of Civil Procedures for the Federal District.

In this case, based on the best interests of the minor, he/she will be under the care and attention of one of them. The other will be obliged to collaborate in their feeding and will retain the rights of surveillance and coexistence with the minor, in accordance with the modalities provided in the agreement or judicial resolution. (Federal Civil Code, 2021).

Being then that the judge and only he, is the one who has the power to resolve any controversy that arises during the separation process. In addition, as one of the main interests and objectives of carrying out a healthy coexistence of the three parties (father, mother and son) is that the emotional state of the minor is the least affected, being that the mere fact of separation is already by itself only difficult for this one. We can say that SAP is a consequence of the post-separation process.

In article 417 of the CCF it precisely mentions the relationship that should exist with the parents for when one is exercising the custody and custody of the child, it reaffirms the healthy coexistence that should exist and that one alone does not have the right to decide on the child while both have parental authority.

“Those who exercise parental authority, even when they do not have custody, have the right to coexist with their descendants, unless there is danger for them.

Personal relationships between the minor and his relatives may not be impeded without just cause. In case of opposition, at the request of any of them, the family judge will decide what is conducive in attention to the best interests of the minor. Only by judicial mandate may the right of coexistence referred to in the previous paragraph be limited, suspended or lost, as well as in cases of suspension or loss of parental authority, in accordance with the modalities established in the agreement or judicial resolution”. (Federal Civil Code, 2021).

Although, the order is not respected and is breached when one of the parties does not benefit from the personal interests of the other parent for their child, this is where the questioning of intrigue towards the opposite parent begins, even if he has the right to full coexistence with the minor.

Of the various states that make mention of PARENTAL ALIENATION are:

SAP is not a disease that is scientifically or medically recognized, however, the term exists and is used in some laws, as we could see in the previous information. Other States only recognize that there is a form of psychological violence that causes problems in the free development of each child or adolescent inserted in a conflict that does not belong to them. However, they do not determine it as alienation and despite the fact that the conflict is generated by their own parents where, although they have a sanction, it does not solve the uncomfortable situation in which the minor lived during the time that this misconduct has developed.

A very important point of this topic is that not in all the codes they speak of parental alienation practiced only by parents, it speaks of the manipulation generated by a relative, where one is on the side of one of the parties with the aim of generate rejection of the opposite parent of the alienating family.

In the following table some codes of the same ones that we have mentioned previously are indicated, however, only a comparison is made of the sanctions that each Code regulates according to its State; mentioning the articles corresponding to the topic of "parental alienation", and the time of their reforms.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LAW THAT ESTABLISHES IT</th>
<th>ARTICLE</th>
<th>YEAR OF REFORM</th>
<th>SANCTION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>STATE OF TAMAULIPAS</strong></td>
<td>ART 260</td>
<td>● (1st reform POE No. 140 of 24-Nov-2010) ● (Last reform Extraordinary POE No. 14 of December 15, 2017)</td>
<td>Establish as a therapeutic measure attendance at talks related to the act of manipulation described in this article, which will be given by specialists from the Family Coexistence Centers, or where appropriate, by the System for Integral Development of the Family, having to present the proof of attendance before the judge.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CIVIL CODE FOR THE STATE OF BAJA CALIFORNIA</strong></td>
<td>ART 420 BIS</td>
<td>● Amended by Decree No. 95, published in Official Gazette No. 32, Section II, Volume CXXIV, dated July 14, 2017, issued by the H. XXII Legislature, with C. Francisco Arturo Vega de Lamadrid 20013 being Constitutional Governor -2016.</td>
<td>The necessary therapeutic measures will be ordered ex officio for the minor children and their parents, in order to restore healthy coexistence with both parents. For these effects, both parents will have the obligation to collaborate in the fulfillment of the measures that are determined, being able the judge to make use of the coercion measures that the present Code establishes for its fulfillment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CIVIL CODE FOR THE FREE AND SOVEREIGN STATE OF BAJA CALIFORNIA SOUTH</strong></td>
<td>ART 23 BIS</td>
<td></td>
<td>The judge will order ex officio the necessary therapeutic measures for minors, in order to restore healthy coexistence with both parents.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CIVIL CODE FOR THE STATE OF COLIMA.</strong></td>
<td>ART 441 AND 417 BIS</td>
<td>● (ADDED. DEC. 293, PO 18, APRIL 5, 2014) FIRST PARAGRAPH, ART; 441 ● (ADDED. DEC. 293, PO 18, APRIL 5, 2014) SECOND PARAGRAPH, ART; 441</td>
<td>The judge, ex officio, will order the necessary therapeutic measures for the minor children, in order to restore healthy coexistence with both parents; having these the obligation to collaborate in the fulfillment of the measures that to the effect are ordered.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CIVIL CODE FOR THE STATE OF DURANGO</strong></td>
<td>ART 278,279 AND 406 BIS.</td>
<td>Follow-up and therapies necessary to avoid and correct acts of family violence or parental alienation, which may be suspended or modified in the terms provided by article 973 of the Code of Civil Procedures of the State of Durango.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **CIVIL CODE OF THE STATE OF GUANAJUATO** | ART 474 AY 500 | • PARAGRAPH TRAVELED IN ITS ORDER PO 17-10 2014  
• ADDED ARTICLE PO 06-10-2005 | The judge will apply the measures provided for in the Code of Civil Procedures and may even order the change of custody of minors prior to the respective procedure, when whoever has judicially decreed provisional or definitive custody over them, repeatedly unjustifiably prevents the coexistence of the minors. minors with the person or persons who have judicially recognized their right to it. |
| **FAMILY CODE FOR THE STATE OF MICHOACÁN DE OCAMPO** | ART 318,422, 435 AND 438 | | In the event that the minor presents parental alienation, this and the alienating father will be subjected to the treatment indicated by the specialist who has diagnosed the disorder and all contact with said ancestor will be suspended, being able to regain that right, when he demonstrates that he is in conditions of promote the affective presence of both parents, in the process of formation of the child.  
If in the exercise of the right of coexistence, the parent incurs acts of parental alienation, he will be suspended from it, until he regains the ability to return to have the beneficial approach for the minor. |
| **FAMILY CODE FOR THE FREE AND SOVEREIGN STATE OF MORELOS** | ART 224 | • REFORMED BY DECREES NO. 1439. PUBLISHED IN THE OFFICIAL PROIO "TIERRA Y LIBERTAD" No 5194 OF DATE 2014/06/11. VALIDITY 2014/06/1. | At any time in which the Parental Alienation Syndrome occurs by any of the parents towards the children, the Family Judge, ex officio will order the necessary therapeutic measures for the minor children, in order to restore healthy coexistence with both parents. For these effects, both parents will have the obligation to collaborate in the fulfillment of the measures that are determined, being able the judge to make use of the coercion measures that the present Code establishes for its fulfillment. |
| **FAMILY CODE FOR THE FREE AND SOVEREIGN STATE OF PUEBLA** | ART 291 | • REFORMED IN 09/14/1998.  
• PARAGRAPH ADDED ON 01/24/2020 | It does not establish, it uses the general term of "parental alienation". |
Most of the States reflected in this table order a psychological treatment as the most correct sanction, I come to the conclusion that they see this fact as far as possible, easier to solve, since taking into account that if the problem of parental authority, guardianship and custody can be suspended indefinitely if the alienating party does not correct their behavior.

- Aguascalientes State
- Guanajuato
- Michoacan
- Mexico state

These are the states of the country that bring sufficient measures to persevere with healthy coexistence. Parental authority, guardianship and custody can be suspended indefinitely if the alienating party does not correct their behavior.
Not only the CPEUM, THE STATE CODES AND THE FEDERAL make use of the term or action raised in these times "parental alienation" we also have precedents in our jurisprudence. In this regard, thesis number II.2O.C.17 C (10A.) Establishes the use of this term, which is and when it occurs, indicates that the parental alienation syndrome is an act that must be taken into account in order to determine the conflict that may result to a lesser degree but that this should not determine the separation of the alienator-child, on the contrary that only a psychological treatment should be ordered to restore good and healthy coexistence between all, since the separation with one of the parents for the minor may not be the best decision.

3. Main actors of parental alienation syndrome- parental breakdown

Parental alienation is represented by three figures; (Dad, mom and son) they are the protagonists in this fact, which is why we gave reason to this investigation. The consequence of knowing what role each one plays and from where the behavior of the parties involved is born. Also the level of severity with which it is practiced and the behaviors that are presented.

This behavior can be motivated by many issues, but all for the same purpose “to show rejection to one of the parents.”

One of the first actors of the parental alienation syndrome is the programmer or alienating parent, who begins by performing the manipulative behavior. Gardner defends the existence of a conscious mental programming and less explicit unconscious situations.

The attachment that may exist between the child-parent relationship is one way in which the child's behavior can be most influenced. It is presumed that in the mother-child relationship there could be a higher probability of PAS practice, since this is the one who in most of the time lives more with the child and logically is the one who has the most influence on it. Of course, a programming parent does not cease to exist and in a short time the figures for this behavior are equal.

Behaviors of an alienating parent:

- They prevent telephone contact with children.
- They usually organize different activities with their children during the period that the other parent must exercise their right to visit.
- They introduce their new spouse to the children as their new mother or his new father.
- They intercept mail and packages sent to children.
- They devalue and insult the other parent in front of the children and also in its absence.
- They do not inform the other parent about the activities carried out by the children (sports, theater, school activities ...).
- They speak rudely of the other parent's new spouse.
- They prevent the other parent from exercising their visitation rights.
- "They forget" to notify the other parent of important appointments child with dentists, doctors, psychologists, etc.
- They involve their environment (their mother, their new spouse, grandparents ...) in brainwashing children.

According to Judge Graciela G. Buchanan Ortega. President of the Superior Court of Justice and of the Judicial Council of the State of Nuevo León, there are two ways to practice SAP:

1. **Aware**, by doing so with the intention of undermining the parental relationship; either, as a form of punishment for the non-custodial parent, or to justify to their children the actions that they have taken or are going to take.

2. **Unconscious**(from a learned formula), when taking the children as confidants or as an outlet for their relationship problems; Even the simple fact of allowing minors to listen to conversations related to their non-custodial parent, believing that they are not paying attention, could trigger parental alienation syndrome.

This behavior not only has two ways of practicing them, it also has levels of action:
1. **Mild**: Alienation is relatively superficial and children basically cooperate with visitors, albeit critical and upset at times.

2. **Moderate**: Children are more negative and disrespectful. The campaign of denigration can be almost continuous, especially in times of transition, where children appreciate that the disapproval of the cohabiting parent is just what their custodial parent wants. They are offensive and distant.

3. **Severe**: Visits become impossible. The hostility of the children is so intense that they can even lead to verbal or physical violence. (Buchanan Ortega, 2015)

The second figure is the alienated father / mother, he / she is confused and feels guilty, most of them recognize themselves as a victim, they are very frustrated by their impotence in the face of manipulation and whatever they do they cannot win, if they fight they are a stalker, if they withdraws is negligent. The most frequent attitude of the alienated father is silence, thinking that they are not going to repeat the same mistake of the programmer. Believing that the child will come to an independent conclusion alone is completely naive. (Oropeza Ortiz, 2007)

As can be seen, the mere fact that the alienated parent ignores the behavior that is being taken by the programming parent, that is, the alienating person does not change the situation, much less improve it. This act has many consequences, but its main function is to denigrate the alienated parent with certain behaviors that he adopts, with an attitude of contempt for one of his parents.

**Actions carried out by a child against their parents:**

- Denigration campaign.
- Weak, absurd, or frivolous justifications for contempt.
- The child makes irrational or ridiculous arguments for not wanting to be near one of his parents.
- Absence of ambivalence.
- Independent thinker phenomenon.
- Reflective support for the alienating parent.
- Absence of guilt towards the cruelty of the hated father.
- Presence of borrowed arguments.
- Extension of animosity to the extended family (AVALOS PRETELL, 2018)

It is a bit difficult to believe that a child says he hates or despises his father / mother without just cause, just for the fact that one of them told him and made him believe that the other parent “is bad, he does not want it, he only uses it” By means of totally false sentences.

The problem does not lie in the action that is carried out but in the effect it causes on others and how much it can be extended, because although this SYNDROME only applies to parents and children, we realize that it is not like that. In this sense, it is considered pertinent to capture the statistics of divorces in the Mexican state to consider the increase in this situation and the consequences in children immersed in this context.
This graph shows the national statistics from 2015 to 2019 regarding the divorce rates by States of the Mexican Republic that regulate the SAP.
Table 2. Effects of parental alienation syndrome.

| PSYCHOLOGIC AL EFFECTS | Emotional imbalance that is due to this cause, the child presents a vulnerable state as he is being a victim of parental alienation: 
| | ● **Anxiety disorder:** rapid breathing, increased tone of voice and emotional overflow generated by the stress caused by visiting the rejected parent. 
| | ● **Sleep and eating disorder:** problems falling asleep and lack of appetite derived from the situation in which they live. |
| LEGAL EFFECTS | The legislation obliges the family judge to ensure the best interests of the child or adolescent, even when long and costly judicial processes are carried out for the parties involved, it is worth mentioning the emotional exhaustion for the same people who are part of the process and between them minors. In addition, during the separation process, the anger that parents may have with each other increases a little more, being a logical and unjustified reason for the practice of the “parental alienation syndrome”. |
| FAMILY EFFECTS | In the practice of PAS, the first effect that is most noticeable is parental breakdown, the bond that existed between the parties at a certain time and affective wear and tear being more noticeable. There are certain disorders that children who are victims of “parental alienation derived from the family environment can suffer: 
| | ● **Aggressive behavior:** being quite low the possibility of coexistence, arriving insults and physical aggressions. 
| | ● **Avoidance behavior:** the realization of health problems, an unwell state which causes the absence of visits. 
| | ● **Emotional dependence:** the fear they feel of being abandoned by a parent despite the fact that being well with one, causes rejection to the other. 
| | ● **Difficulties in expressing and understanding emotions:** their attitude is seen in a normal negative state, they tend to have little empathy and are rigid with the alienated parent. |
| SOCIAL EFFECTS | The effects of parental alienation are very diverse, since not only the family nucleus is affected; father, mother and children, but also all those people who live or are related to them. In this way, self-esteem, self-image and their self-concept represent a very important factor for them in their development and performance. Thus when experiencing these feelings in the field; family, school and social they begin to show certain negative behaviors such as fears, fears, emotional instability, showing vulnerability in academic performance, being under an asocial behavior. Among the consequences in the social sphere can be found the following: 
| | ● **Low academic performance:** Their attention to what is explained to them in class is disinterested but their low performance is associated with SAP, since their current behavior is not due to their own cognitive level of their age. 
| | ● **Asocial or maladaptive behavior:** Usually children impregnated by this syndrome do not seek to adapt to society, they feel inferior and prefer to be alone, although this generates low self-esteem and has repercussions on the child. |

**Note:** Laguna Razo, M., & Aguilar Tun, F. (2017). Due compliance with the best interests of children and adolescents in a family dispute. Thesis.

**Conclusion**

The Parental Alienation Syndrome is the manipulation carried out by one of the parents in order to generate rejection, hatred on the part of the minor towards his other ancestor which causes the breakdown of the family bond that brings with it various implications, both effects and consequences for all parties involved.

Divorce and separation are the main cause of the practice of PAS, although it can also occur when there is no separation. At the national level, Mexico does not regulate parental alienation in all its states, nor do all states that do so establish the same sanction, although most of it is similar. It is worth mentioning that the Mexican country strictly protects in its legislation the best interests of children and adolescents, it says that first of all the integrity of each child must prevail, since they cannot fully enforce themselves and it is their parents who are the ones. They must take care of providing an emotional and of course physical environment.
Tabasco is not a State that regulates the Parental Alienation Syndrome, however, proposals have been presented so that our Tabasco legislation can more broadly protect the Best Interests of Children and safeguard the family union.

There will always be changes and modifications in the laws, new authors that define the SAP, more rigid sanctions than others, but the real objective is to enforce them and respect each one of them, not to break the bond of affection that exists between the ascendants - descendants by doing of them a lower emotional level and suffer future negative consequences.

References

Suaste Guerra, E., 2014. Parental alienation as loss of parental authority. Lasallian University Benavente Faculty of Law.